COA25-04 27 American Legion PI, Depot Street Investments LLC (Petitioner) requests permission for the demolition of a side addition portion of a structure within the "DT" Downtown and Historic Districts.

Exhibits:

1. Site Plan

Location and Surrounding Uses:

- North DT Downtown & Historic District Commercial
- South DT Downtown & Historic District & RTO Recreational Trail Overlay Municipal
- East DT Downtown & Historic District Municipal / Commercial
- West DT Downtown & Historic District Municipal



Aerial Site Location

Zoning Site Location

Site History & Current Conditions:

The property in question is comprised primarily of a historic brick and stone building iconic to the Greenfield Historic District, and known as "The Old Jail", owing to the original historic use of the property as a jail facility and sheriff's residence. Many decades ago, a Guard House was added to the south façade of the primary building, extending towards E South St. This addition was not done with any respect for the historic qualities of the primary structure and is completely incongruous with the architectural style of the surrounding and connected buildings.

Current Proposal:

Ignoring the problematic visual aspects of it, the Guard House has been in a state of disuse and disrepair for many years. There are extensive repairs and modifications needed to bring it into code compliance since the use of the property as a jail ceased. An example of such needed modifications is the fact that the "ADA ramp" on the southeast side is far too steep to be used by anyone in a manually operated wheelchair. It has been an understood intention for some time that someday, somebody would remove the Guard House from the Historic District.

The Petitioner is proposing to demolish the incongruous addition known as the Guard House while keeping the more historic brick and stone structure of the "Old Jail". Discussions have been had with the Petitioner regarding the addition of an ADA-code compliant access ramp from this side of the remaining building, coupled with the installation of a small number of parking spaces and landscaping where the Guard House is to be removed. However, any future plans will need to be adjusted based on the findings on-site after the demolition of the

CITY OF GREENFIELD HISTORIC BOARD OF REVIEW - June 5, 2025

Guard House. As such, no formal plans showing precisely what is proposed to be installed have been provided for review.

An understanding has been reached between the Petitioner and the Planning Department which proposes a two-phase Development Plan process. The first phase would be the demolition of Guard House portion of the site and an evaluation of the site post-demolition. Based on these findings, a second and more complete Development Plan will be proposed for the rehabilitation of the site post-demolition. This second phase would require a return to Plan Commission and Historic Board of Review for approval through all of the normal processes that any Development Plan would require.

As no Development Plans showing what is to be installed post-demolition have been provided to Staff, all further comments should be taken in light of this being a general understanding of what is intended to happen, but with no confidence in the details of those actions. Staff is unable to provide findings or opinions on plans which have not been formally submitted.

Landscaping:

No Development Plans or their associated Landscaping Plans have been provided to Staff for review.

Findings:

A formal Development Proposal showing what is to be built on the site of the demolished structure is required to be submitted. Included in that proposal is required to be a Landscape Plan created by a licensed Landscape Architect. Staff can not provide a review or opinion until those plans are provided. It is understood that such plans will be provided as part of the second phase of this petition's demolition & redevelopment proposals.

Specific requirements of the landscaping will depend on what is proposed in the postdemolition Development Plan, but generally they will be required to have screening of parking areas and street trees if / where appropriate. Foundational Landscape Screening along the remaining building as well as any structures built after the demolition would be in keeping with the surrounding historic district.

Historic District:

As this property is located within the Historic District, a Certificate of Appropriateness will be required based on the proposed demolition. The Historic Board of Review provides "CoA"s after careful review to ensure a proposal is appropriate for and keeps harmony with the surrounding properties within the Historic District.

Findings:

The Guard House's general design, look, and the specific materials used are inconsistent with the attached historic building as well as the surrounding buildings within the Historic District. As such, its removal would be a boon to the district's harmonious aesthetic. Any structures built post-demolition on this site should take these things into account and seek to enhance the aesthetic by being congruous with the attached historic building in both design and materials used.

A formal Development Plan proposal showing what is to be built on the site of the demolished structure will be required. Included in that proposal is required to be a Landscape Plan created by a licensed Landscape Architect. The HBR will need to follow the same two-phase review process as designated for the Plan Commission Petition, and the HBR approval will be required at each phase prior to permits being issued or work being begun.

Staff Recommendation: Approve the demolition request, subject to the findings in the staff report and the following conditions:

- 1. Approval of the Demolition must be obtained from the Planning Commission prior to the issuance of any work permits or the beginning of any demolition on the site in question for this petition.
- 2. A demolition permit must be obtained prior to demolition and subject to the following:
 - a. Contractor is responsible to see that all water and sewer utilities are abandoned to the satisfaction of the City of Greenfield Utilities. All other utilities must be capped / removed according to the requirements of the utility.
 - b. All debris must be removed from site and disposed of properly.
 - c. Remove foundation, concrete slab, underground/under slab plumbing lines.
 - d. Backfill with dirt, topped with 6 inches of top soil, and properly grade the lot and seed and straw for effective erosion control.
 - e. Contractor is liable for any damage to surrounding properties. Surrounding properties are to be restored / cleaned to the condition they were in when the project started, including the public sidewalk and rights of way.
- 3. Full Development Plans and Landscape Plans showing what is to be installed after the Demolition must be provided to and receive approval from all relevant City Departments, the Historic Board of Review, and the Plan Commission prior to any permit being issued beyond those necessary for the demolition of the Guard House as described in this Staff Report.
- 4. Within 2 months of the completion of the demolition, Petitioner shall be required to submit a Development Plan for the redevelopment of the site for approval by the relevant City Departments.
- 5. Petitioner shall be required to obtain approval of the above-mentioned post-demolition Development Plan from the Plan Commission, the Historic Board of Review, and all relevant City Departments within 6 months of the approval of this petition.

